

LUZERNE COUNTY HOME RULE TRANSITION COMMITTEE

**November 14, 2011
MINUTES**

CALL TO ORDER/PLEDGE

The twenty-ninth meeting of the HRTC convened in the Jury Meeting Room at the Luzerne County Courthouse, 200 River Street, Wilkes-Barre, Pennsylvania. It was called to order by Chair, Jim Bobeck at 6:33 pm.

ROLL CALL

PRESENT

Jim Bobeck, Chair
Ronna Ciaruffoli, Secretary
Susan Shoval, Treasurer
Edd Brominski
Elaine Maddon Curry
Tom Cooney
Harry Haas
Jim Haggerty
Kick Heffron
Linda McCloskey-Houck
Eugene Kelleher
CJ Kersey
Tim McGinley
Rick Morelli
Maryanne Petrilla
Steve A. Urban
Steve J. Urban
Rick Williams

ABSENT

Rob Bakewell, Vice Chair

ALSO PRESENT

Gloria Kijek, Clerk
Ken Mohr, Consultant

PUBLIC COMMENT (AGENDA ITEMS)

None.

HIRING PROCESS FOR COUNTY MANAGER AND CLERK OF COUNTY COUNCIL

- a. **HRTC MEMBER PARTICIPATION– Discuss regarding which members may participate to avoid conflicts of interest and in keeping with Section 9.05 Nepotism of Home Rule Charter.**

Jim Bobeck stated that in complying with the Home Rule Charter, 1) any member of the HRTC who is an immediate family member to anyone applying for the County Manager or Clerk to county Council position, and 2) any member of the HRTC who applied for either position, or anyone with a conflict of interest should be excluded from the selection process.

Motion to enforce Section 9.05, Nepotism, of Home Rule Charter (Motion 1).

Motion Tim McGinley.

Second Linda McCloskey Houck.
Unanimous vote.
Motion carried.

Rick Williams suggested a “straw poll”, prior to voting to reopen the hiring process, to determine if 1) the HRTC, by a majority vote, would pass a motion to reopen the process, but keep applicant information confidential, and 2) would members honor the majority vote. If any member was going to release the information then it makes that proposed motion a moot point. If someone says they are not going to sign the confidentiality agreement and they are going to release the names, we cannot assure the applicant that their information is going to be kept confidential. Jim Bobeck responded by saying that any person who refused to sign the confidentiality statement would not get the applicants packet.

Rick Williams made a motion to consider reopening the hiring process for a period of two weeks, modifying the advertisement to assure applicants of confidentiality until the group of finalists have been selected, at which time the finalists will be informed and given the opportunity to withdraw their applications before having their names made public.

Jim Bobeck asked for clarification before continuing. Rick Williams revised the Motion to first consider a previous motion that dealt with revisiting the manager’s solicitation and application process. The HRTC discussed everything involved in the process, including the efforts of the Personnel and Recruiting Subcommittee. It was the general consensus that although the goal was to get the largest field of good applicants, a re-solicitation may deter qualified applicants from re-applying, and damage the credibility of the HRTC and Luzerne County.

Motion to consider the motion to readdress the application process (Motion 2).
Motion Rick Williams.
Second Tom Cooney.
4 in favor, Tom Cooney, Steve A. Urban, Steve J. Urban, Rick Williams.
1 abstained, Elaine Madden Curry.
13 remaining opposed.
Motion failed.

HRTC discussed whether members should identify themselves now if they are aware of conflict of interest or wait until they receive packets, then remove themselves from selection process.

Motion to remove yourself from the selection process in any way if you’ve applied for County Manager or Clerk to County Council position (Motion 3).
Motion Susan Shoval.
Second Harry Haas.
Unanimous vote.
Motion carried.

b. APPLICANT INFORMATION RELEASE -Whether none, all, or only finalists applicant information will be publically released.

HRTC members discussed when, if at all, and how much of the applicant information should be released. Rick Morelli suggested laying out all the different scenarios and voting on each. Ken Mohr

stated some applicants specified they wanted their applications withdrawn if they were to be made public, and explained possible ramifications of the release of applicants' information to the public, specifically, losing qualified applicants. Some members felt that even though transparency is important we need to remain professionalism during the process, and if names are to be released, when the right time would be. Elaine Curry suggested possibly releasing the 3 to 5 finalists and even possibly having a public forum with them.

Motion to release names of County Manager and Clerk to County Council applicants (Motion 4).

Motion Rick Morelli.

Second Steve J. Urban.

3 in favor, Rick Morelli, Steve A. Urban, Steve J. Urban.

15 remaining opposed.

Motion failed.

c. MEETING STATUS – Open or Executive (decision dependent on item 4.b. outcome.)

Jim Bobeck stated all discussions referring to the selection process for County Manager and Clerk to County Council will be held at Executive Sessions.

d. RANKING OF APPLICANTS – Discussion regarding which factors (e.g. education, management/governmental experience, proven outcomes, etc.) will be considered, and how weighed in ranking candidates.

Members discussed the ranking sheet, and who should be involved in the process. Ken Mohr suggested everyone that qualifies for participation in the selection process should. Rick Morelli expressed concern about involving members who would not be involved in the final vote. The method of ranking was also discussed. Susan Shoal suggested reviewing C's first to determine if they should be considered further in the process. Ken Mohr suggested ranking the top 21 but HRTC can choose as many as they want to rank. Members would have 10 days to rank then Ken Mohr would consolidate the results and identify the top candidates. Some members felt the least qualified applicants (Cs) may be removed but members should at least look at all candidates. Jim Bobeck requested the members review the C group by Wednesday 11/16 meeting to determine if any of those applicants should be considered further. Tim McGinley stated that since this was part of the selection process, members with conflicts should not be part of this decision. Ken Mohr stated there were at least 2 members who should be eliminated from the process. Members then did an Aye/Nay vote, with unanimous "Ayes" to eliminate votes of any member with a conflict of interest from any motion pertaining to the selection process.

Ken Mohr explained the criteria and percentage of ranking system as being Education 10%, Leadership/Mgmt Experience 35%, County/Local Govt. Experience 35%, Productive Outcomes 15%, and Other 5%.

Motion to accept Ken Mohr's 5 criteria as specified on ranking sheet, adding Communication Skills to Leadership/Mgmt Experience category (Motion 5).

Motion Tom Cooney.

Second Rick Morelli.

1 abstained, Steve A. Urban.

17 in favor.

Motion carried.

HRTC then discussed the percentages on each of these criteria's and if they felt they were appropriate. Motion to accept all the percentages as is except change the Productive Outcomes to 20% and County/Local Govt. Experience to 30% (Motion 6).

Motion Steve J. Urban.

Second Susan Shoval.

1 abstained, Steve A. Urban.

8 opposed, Edd Brominski, Jim Haggerty, Kick Heffron, Linda Houck, CJ Kersey, Tim McGinley, Rick Morelli, and Maryanne Petrilla.

9 remaining in favor.

Motion carried.

Jim Haggerty commented that he was concerned that we just voted to make County/Local Govt. Experience less relevant then our consultant suggested.

Motion to adopt criteria percentages to Education 10%, Leadership/Management/Communications 35%, County/Local Govt. Experience to 30%, Productive Outcomes to 20%, Other 5% (Motion 7).

Motion Gene Kelleher.

Second Maryanne Petrilla..

1 abstained, Steve A. Urban.

8 opposing votes, Edd Brominski, Jim Haggerty, Kick Heffron, Linda Houck, CJ Kersey, Tim McGinley, Rick Morelli, Maryanne Petrilla

9 remaining in favor.

Motion carried.

CONCLUDING REMARKS

Elaine Curry commented that she has formally resigned from the Luzerne County Diversity Committee and the Luzerne County Community College.

Ronna Ciaruffoli commented that Steve J. Urban holds an elected position.

Jim Bobeck said we will discuss specifics of elected offices with Attorney Malak at next meeting.

Kick Heffron recommended that HRTC discuss the interim process.

Rick Williams disclosed his architecture firm has a small contract with Luzerne County Housing but he will no longer be employed at architecture.

Susan Shoval commented that if one of the votes to change percentages of criteria has to be re-voted because of conflict of interest, she has no problem with this.

Jim Bobeck commented that, regardless of percentages, we will not eliminate anyone that is a potentially a good candidate for County Manager.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Tom Dombroski, Trucksville – Commented that some HRTC members may not realize at this point that they have conflict of interests.

George Race, Exeter Township – Asked if Executive Sessions will be advertised and the reason for it given.

Jim Bobeck answered yes to both.

Walter Griffith, Wilkes-Barre Township - Asked if budget would be discussed, because there was no number yet for the County manager position.

Steve A. Urban said there is still time and budget can be changed by the incoming council up until February 16, 2012.

Charles Hatchko, Jenkins Township – Expressed concern about nepotism and openness in new government.

Therman Guamp, Edwardsville – Commented that when working budget, plug numbers for placeholder so as not to hold up the process.

Ed Warkevicz, - Asked Commissioners to stop spending money, and expressed concern about ongoing action transferring people in courthouse between departments.

Rick Morelli asked the commissioners for status on the 2012 budget.

Steve A. Urban replied budget will be passed without raising taxes.

APPLICANT INFORMATION DISTRIBUTION UPON EXECUTION OF CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT

Rick Morelli stated that although he would not sign the confidentiality agreement, he will respect the vote of the others and will not release the information regarding the candidates unless voted to do so at another time in the future.

Jim Haggerty requested that no member receive the packet if they did not sign the Confidentiality Agreement.

Jim Bobeck commented that this was a motion we voted on and was approved, and asked that everyone respect the rules of the committee, and stated that any member who did not sign the agreement would not receive a packet.

Steve J. Urban reported that he was not part of the Transition Committee when the Confidentiality Agreement was voted on and would not sign the agreement.

ADJOURNMENT

Motion Linda Houck.

Second Gene Kelleher.

Unanimous vote.

Motion carried.

Meeting adjourned at 8:50 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,
Chairman Jim Bobeck

